



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

REPORT ON AN EXPERIMENTAL TEST OF MUSICAL EXPRESSIVENESS.

BY BENJAMIN IVES GILMAN.

During the latter half of last March I sent to a number of residents of Cambridge and Boston who are interested in music a circular of invitation, from which the following sentences are an extract:—

AN EXPERIMENTAL CONCERT.—May I ask your aid in an attempt to make an experimental contribution to the question so much debated regarding the power of music to awaken definite ideas and emotions in the listener. It has occurred to me that some results of value might be reached if a careful selection of musical fragments, to which a definite expressiveness has been attributed, were to be performed in the hearing of a number of persons interested in music, who should previously agree to set down independently of each other the impressions they receive therefrom. Should a sufficient number of those to whom this notice is sent signify their willingness to join in such an undertaking, I propose to give what may be called an experimental concert, on some evening to be hereafter selected. A lack of theoretical knowledge of music need in no way be regarded as a disqualification for the task proposed. On the contrary those who *feel* rather than *understand* music are to be considered to be the best audience for such a purpose. An interest in the purely musical aspect of a composition might hinder rather than help that imaginative grasp of it which it is here desired to test.

I propose to obtain the listeners' judgments in the form of answers to a question prepared beforehand on each of a number of musical selections, which appear in a definite way expressive either to myself or others.

The questions will be numbered and each of the listeners will be provided with a notebook, in which he will be asked to jot down his reply (to be numbered to correspond) without consultation with others, during a pause after each selection. Each listener will be asked to write down the name of any one of the fragments which proves familiar to him.

The undertaking is so entirely novel that it is difficult to predict its outcome, but I am sure there are many among us whose imaginative interest in the art of tone and power of giving this interest expression are capable, if the right opportunity be offered, of throwing a valuable light on the vexed question of musical expressiveness.

About thirty persons were kind enough to accede to this request, and on the evening of the 29th of April the experiment took place in a parlor in Cambridge.

The instruments used were a grand piano (from the Mason & Hamlin Co., Boston.) and the violin. The interpretation

of the programme was intrusted to three well-known musicians of Boston, Mr. Charles L. Capen (piano), Miss E. M. Yerrinton (piano) and Mr. A. van Raalte (violin). I am glad to express my appreciation of the interest in the undertaking displayed by these artists, and my thanks for their skillful coöperation.

The whole company, performers and audience, began the evening in a very sceptical frame of mind regarding not only the value of any data which might be obtained, but even the possibility of carrying out such a test. The result belied our forebodings. The method of inquiry proved a practicable one, and there was, I think, a general feeling of surprise among the listeners at the amount of booty rewarding their determined efforts to capture the suggestions of the music played. I may be permitted to express my personal belief that only very rarely indeed would it be found possible to enlist in such a cause as much ingenuity, candor and good-will as was shown by the subjects of this experiment. It was expected that several musicians by profession would be among their number, but as it turned out the audience consisted entirely of amateurs. A large minority, if not a majority, of these were without special skill on any instrument; a few were distinctly non-musical in the sense of having no marked endowment of musical ear or memory; but there were none present, I think, who were not capable, at least at times, of enjoying and feeling music deeply.

The work of the evening consisted in obtaining answers to fourteen questions based upon thirteen selections of music, one being the subject of two questions. Nearly all of the pieces were played more than once, some several times, and although they succeeded each other almost without intermission, except for putting the questions and making necessary explanations, the experiment lasted without any relaxation in the interest of the participants from eight o'clock until about midnight. Twenty-eight notebooks were the result, sixteen contributed by gentlemen and twelve by ladies, the former being indicated in the transcription below by Roman, the latter by italic capital letters. Each listener replied on an average to about three-quarters of the questions. The contents of the notebooks here follow (one written in German is translated) appended to the several questions, with each of which is given the particulars of the music to which it refers and the expression of opinion on which it was founded. Two of the selections were fragments of elaborate concerted compositions, and as it proved that the suggestion of these which alone could be given by the piano and violin, did not afford sufficient basis for judgment, they are not here reported upon.

As one of them was the subject of two questions the following transcription consists of the replies to eleven questions on eleven different selections. These are all either piano compositions or melodies written for the voice with or without accompaniment. The notes are given as they were handed in at the close of the evening, with changes (to carry out the intention of the writer either evident or since ascertained) in perhaps not more than a score of words in all. The selections are understood to have been unrecognized unless the contrary is expressly stated.

QUESTION I.

Give any image that is strikingly suggested to your mind by the course of the following piece.

Beethoven. Pianoforte Prelude in F Minor. It bears no opus number, but in the Breitkopf and Härtel edition of Beethoven's Works, is No. 195 in Series 18, "Kleinere Stücke für das Pianoforte."

To the writer its character is that of an unending contest with an opposition that bars every advance. It is an attempt to hew a way through adamant. We could fancy ourselves listening to the tireless dialectic of a mediæval schoolman on some transcendental thesis, or even admitted to the mind of a melancholiac eternally resenting miseries eternally visited upon him afresh. Dry and gloomy energy doing doughty deeds to no purpose is to me the burden of the piece. Piano solo.

ANSWERS TO I.

A. The swaying of the treetops in a moderate wind; weird songs are sung beneath the trees.

B. A country church appeared to me; the music formed the chimes; the surrounding scenes were grave or gay as the music became slow and soft or fast and loud. As it died away a funeral train seemed passing.

C. No image. Technique (not of performance but of composition) entirely covers up the æsthetic effect. I cannot help being lost in the sequence of the strain, especially on an instrument of percussion like the piano.

D. At first, organist seated at organ in church, then a change at end to twilight; a large hall; a man who has felt sorrow, yet feels the grandeur of life above all, improvises; a love sadness.

E. Plunge of a torrent in the woods; then children's feet dancing as the key changes; sunburst. Thenceforward the piece gets more dramatic, forming a sort of tumultuous dialogue or inward dilemma of affirmation and negation. It rolls on some practical moral decision, and with moments of peace or weary diversion it ends in a sort of forgetting calm without particular triumph.

F. A hymn of thankfulness.

H. Persistent struggle with rather mild difficulty, e. g., walking through a wood with thick underbrush.

I. Chime of church bells; bright, sunny morning; gathering to church; in church; entry of minister; hushed; minister rises; ready for service; last stroke of chimes.

J. The rolling up of breaker after breaker on the beach with the sound of more distant rollers in the lulls; or the dying away of a storm.

K. This is a fugue. Fugues always suggest to me the beauty of organism, the universal not being built out of an accretion of particulars

but revealing itself in subtle relations among them. The complexity of law. The essentialness of sadness to happiness.

L. A great strife against something; a final conquering of this something and then rest. This strife seems to return at times and is then quieted; finally, near the end a burst of it and then the quiet closing bars.

M. Suggests a life toiling on through disappointment and struggle, until at last peace comes, a peace of which there had been moments of anticipation. Not a brilliant or a prominent life.

N. The resolute self-possession of the process that is going on suggests at once something very much alive, very free—a nature force in full possession of its own world: *Sie entlässt sich frei, ihrer selbst ganz sicher*, says Hegel of the *Idee*, when it passes over into *Natur*. I have a sense that a water-process would be the scene most naturally suggested. Scene, however, not complete, but waves on water most probable.

O. A rather distinct idea of a workman making something by strokes, as a smith. There is also a feeling that he is in a lazy mood, as if the afternoon sun were streaming in. The work is pleasant.

P. Church; opening voluntary. Religious cheerfulness. A religious dance; measured movement of hands. Or, somewhat, a brook tumbling along over a stony bed. The suggestion of a yearning.

A. (Bach.) A ship approaching end of voyage; all tension; haven.

C. It (the piece) seemed to me to embody the progress of a mountain stream on its course from the hills to the plain, flowing among rocks over many obstacles, under the forest trees, with the quiet and deep repose of the wild wood pervading all. This was the only image that occurred to me. The intensity of the stillness of the wood was most prominent.

D. Persistent effort, resulting in serene progress.

E. A perpetually struggling bird, flying up and beaten back by the wind.

F. Beating of the waves upon the rocks in the receding tide.

G. Storm wind; agitated sea; dashing on rocks or through pines; increasing, then gradually subsiding. A rock-bound coast with weather-beaten woods, mostly pines.

Spiritual vision: Strong emotion; unrest; doubt; gradual peace, though not joy.

H. The last part makes upon me the impression of a scene of farewell, and I seem to see the departing friend disappear beyond a hill.

I. Dark clouds; storm. An old German church with a suggestion at the close of a funeral service over some great and heroic character. A feeling throughout as of a strong resounding sea against a frowning coast.

J. A controversy or argument between a man and a woman, ending in a great peace.

K. The incoming tide dashing on the rocks, with intervals of quiet ebb.

L. Church music; offertoire; also, organ playing while waiting for a wedding party; cheerful, and not too joyful; serene; also, the suggestion of hearing the organ playing inside, while outside, in the summer. (Bach.)

QUESTION II.

The two melodies to be played are said to be in a certain respect opposite in character. What particular form of contrast, if any, do they in your opinion embody?

First eight bars of "O, mio Fernando," aria from the third act of Donizetti's *La Favorita*, and first five bars of "Durch die Wälder," aria from the first act of Weber's *Der Freischütz*. In "The Power of Sound" (London, 1880), p. 108, Edmund Gurney applies to the melody from *La Favorita* the words "flaccid feebleness," and to that from *Der Freischütz* the phrase "serenely and lastingly fair and strong." Violin solo.

ANSWERS TO II.

- A. (1.) An expression of sadness and love.
 (2.) Light-hearted, triumphant affection. Or,
 (1.) Liebesweh.
 (2.) Freude.
- B. Despair; a plea for mercy versus relentless triumph.
- C. Distinctly opposite; something like yearning and satisfaction (in the same range), or doubt and assurance (in the same range), or anxiety and relief.
- D. (1.) Resignation.
 (2.) Gaiety with a touch of something else. Or,
 (1.) A gray haired woman sitting at a window.
 (2.) Some touch of laughter.
- E. (1.) Plaintive, looking to past.
 (2.) Joyous, looking to future.
- Number 1 seemed to me at first to express a noble *resignation*, but later I was uncertain whether *longing* was not more strongly there.
- F. (1.) A farewell, or a regret.
 (2.) A greeting, and an expression of delight.
- G. (1.) Plaintive.
 (2.) Joyous.
- H. The first piece is poetic, melancholy, moonlight music. The second joyous, though with a certain seriousness, and is full of sunlight.
- I. The first melody was sad, depressed, longing, regretful, *relaxed* body. The second was joyous, buoyant, expectant, up and doing.
- J. Sorrow without hope. Sorrow with hope.
- K. (1.) The daughter of a Teutonic chief pleading with a Roman general for her father's life.
 (2.) Triumphant leadership; command. Contrast: The earnest seeking of an essentially feeble nature, and the joyful success in attainment of a nature that is strong.
- L. There is a sense of unsatisfied longing about the first. The second seems vigorous and full of hope. The first is dependent, the second independent, in general effect.
- M. First selection reminds me of moonlight on the ocean; calm; a small boat rowed slowly. Second suggests a sparkling breeze; in a sailing boat. (N. B. I am fond of the water.)
- N. The well known quotations from two poems of Browning at once suggest themselves as characterizing the contrasted moods.
- (1.) "That was I you heard last night,
 * * * * *
 Serving most with none to see."
- (2.) "So, I shall see her in three days
 And just one night, but nights are short,"
 * * * * *
- [The two poems are those entitled, "A Serenade at the Villa," and "In Three Days," in the *Dramatic Lyrics*.]
- O. Discouragement; confidence. Doubt; gay, nonchalant purpose. The contrast is not very definite in my mind; strong, but vague.
- P. First melody, plaintive; gently sad, as of a lover leaving his

mistress, or a poet who is conscious of missing his ideal, or a girl leaving home to go to school. Second melody, vigorous cheeriness; manly satisfaction; a certain joy and springiness.

A. (1.) Pathos; sadness with hope.

(2.) Allegro; cheerfulness.

C. (1.) Self-controlled emotion.

(2.) Impetuosity.

D. (1.) Looking backward with sadness and regret.

(2.) Looking back on happiness.

E. The first suggests a wandering about in dark places. The second, a buoyant spring upward into regions of light. The shallowness of both strivings is felt.

F. The first expresses hesitation. The second, resolution or achievement.

G. First, a petition, as of one doubtful of the favorable response, but beseeching a hearing; not devotional, but human, as of a lover and his mistress. Second, a reply—not of a love-lorn maid, but cheerful and slightly upbraiding.

H. (1.) Evening peace.

(2.) The freshness of morning.

(1.) Quietude of soul.

(2.) An awakening to new energy.

I. (1.) Sentimental.

(2.) Lively.

J. The first is seeking, the second expresses attainment.

K. A contrast as if a mood of somewhat sad meditation beneath the sighing pines were cast off and serene joy took its place.

L. (1.) Serenade; hopeful.

(2.) Window opens, all is joy; he feels she cares for him.

QUESTION III.

What is the main impression produced by the following passage taken as a whole?

Beethoven. Piano-forte Sonata in D, opus 28 (often called the Pastoral Sonata, but, it is said, without warrant from the composer). Fragment of the allegro, beginning with the 77th bar, and ending with the 125th. According to Edmund Gurney (*Power of Sound*, p. 169), this passage "affects the inner sense with a compulsion, a concentrated passion of movement, so overpowering that I scarcely know its parallel in music; the four bars break in the middle, making the swing of the motive, as it recurs, seem more than ever resistless." The allegro was played from the beginning up to the 136th bar, the attention of the audience being especially called to the passage remarked upon by Gurney. Piano solo.

ANSWERS TO III.

A. Joyful contentment.

B. The piece brought to my mind a girl half talking, half singing to herself, ending with a careless laugh.

C. Very vague; but something like the joyous feeling of out doors, with its invigorating and cheering influences.

D. It suggests the opera; the orchestra works to a mild climax; not the grand climax of the whole. A woman sings one of her *first* songs; a touch of feeling ending with the customary runs.

E. Noble joy on a terrace, eighteenth century, people in pearl color and powder dancing it; then the piece loses that date; the joy appears

based on an assured good impatiently looked for in the rapid running passages, and the reasons of the certainty of its coming rather triumphantly laid down in the staccato thumps.

The above describes the whole piece, not only the termination.

F. The coming of spring.

G. Suggests a melody in one of Sullivan's operas, perhaps *Iolanthe*: "I heard the witch remark, etc."

H. Impression very slight; mild progress and success; runs, to me, are meaningless.

I. Song chorus; jaunt on the cars; singing to the beat on the rails; no deep emotion.

J. Gave me a feeling of light-heartedness, such as one in perfect health has in the early morning of a beautiful day; the joy of life and nature.

K. Renaissance work. Trivialness of surroundings; flounced dresses, hair powder, coats with long skirts silk lined, elaborate walking sticks, —and human hearts beating, life real in it all.

L. This (or something that suggests it strongly) is familiar to me, and as I have entirely material associations with it, I cannot disconnect them from the music. As far as I can do so, it seems at first a little trivial, becoming then more serious, with occasional outbursts of the trivial side.

M. It puzzles me. The impression is filled with charm, but is very difficult to analyze. Suggests something slightly frivolous. A comic opera?

N. Beethoven "Pastoral Sonata." My impressions are very old and personal as to this sonata. I never found especially "pastoral" associations, as such, in the first movement, although I always imagine myself in the open air, under blue sky. But that is arbitrary. The passage in question has purely religious context otherwise in my feeling; the climax of a moment of cheerfully adoring resignation, voluntary abandonment of finitude, with a certain insistent and repeated delight in laying off, as it were, the clothes of one's soul before taking a very jolly flight into the blue.

O. Nothing clear.

P. Dance of village young men and maidens; pleasant or gay responses; mild abandon.

A. A child learning to walk: Step high; step low; faster; ha-a! run!

B. Serene confidence.

C. Undefined.

D. The joyful consent of many.

E. Known: Beethoven. A wavering between two desires, each of which is worthy; now one is stronger, now the other, and the decision comes nearer and nearer. It is almost reached when the steps leading to decision all are shattered and have to be retraced. The conclusion of the whole matter is a decision inconsistent with the premises.

F. A vague impression of regret.

G. No clear impression. The first half brought a remembrance of a peasants' fête in Brittany; the last half, nothing.

H. The joyful uplifting of an oppressed soul that feels itself released from depths of anguish through faith in a kind, heavenly Father.

I. No impression other than a musical one.

J. A demand; a bitter disappointment, concealed by gaiety and non-chalance sometimes, but ill concealed.

K. Rocking in a boat on a dancing, sparkling sea; surroundings cause a happy state of mind.

L. No impression.

QUESTION IV.

The following music has been said to tell a certain story. What dramatic suggestion do you find in it?

Chopin. Ballad No. 2, in F major, opus 38. In his recent essay, "Die Musik und ihre Meister (translated under the title of "A Conversation on Music," N. Y. 1892), Rubinstein writes (p. 10): "Is it possible not to call instrumental music a language? Of course, if the first movement be rendered merely in a lively tempo, the second merely in a slow tempo, and the third merely in a spirited tempo, the executant feeling no necessity for further expression, then we might call instrumental music non-expressive," and regard vocal music as alone capable of real expression. * * * Another example: The Ballad in F major, No. 2, of Chopin. "Is it possible that the interpreter should not feel the necessity of representing to his hearers: a wild flower caught by a gust of wind, a caressing of the flower by the wind, the resistance of the flower, the stormy struggle of the wind, the entreaty of the flower, which at last lies broken? This may also be paraphrased: The wild flower, a rustic maiden; the wind, a knight; and thus with almost every instrumental composition." Piano solo.

ANSWER TO IV.

A. First hearing. Two lovers are on shipboard and their happiness is interrupted by storm and eventual shipwreck.

Second hearing. Two happy lovers are sailing over smooth seas, the ship is attacked by pirates, who are beaten off. A fierce storm arises, the ship bearing the two lovers is destroyed, and after the storm the sun shines again upon the sea, now somewhat calmed.

B. The piece naturally suggested a *murder*. It opens with a picture of the assassin creeping *slowly* along and you hear the shrieks of his intended victim when he is brought face to face with his slayer. Here the music, now *shrill*, now *deep* and *low*, seems to mingle cries and groans as the deed is committed and the man finally dies. The assassin slowly crawls off again and the lighter tones that are introduced seem to be the ordinary events of life passing on about him, producing much the same effect as the knocking on the gate in Macbeth. At the end the murderer is by himself and the last notes suggest regret entirely unavailing over what has happened. It ends with wild remorse.

C. (General impressions in succession.) Devotional; storm; gaiety; stormy; gentle again.

Absolutely no definite dramatic suggestion. If story known could easily be made to fit, but without that no single suggestion, not even perhaps definite emotions.

D. It suggests no definite story. A quiet life interrupted by some sort of passion, back again to the old theme, with something richer in the harmony of the old, something gained from the interruptions.

Second hearing. I do not fully understand the sadness of the first part, that becomes an undercurrent in the first interruption only to reappear. It might be called a romance. In some way it suggests George Sand and Chopin. Mr. — (another listener) tells me his story and I have now the definite picture I lacked.

E. The thumping and haste of the latter one-third or one-half were nothing to me but *intolerably disagreeable* noise, quite meaningless. The first uniform segment of the piece was delicious noise, of which the only dramatic suggestion was the passage through life of a rather rich-mindedly sober and patient sort of man, with one leg shorter than the other. His inner gravity and modesty seemed connected with his lameness. At one point he tumbles off the bank into the water and then, *bang!* is caught in the whirlpool rapids for a long time until he

gets out rather wet; after which nonsense and noise, but for the short gleam of sanity at the very end, which is sweet but irrelevant.

On second hearing arbitrary character of noisy half more infernal than before.

F. Pastoral peace; sudden alarm, (why the lull here?) then conflict, bells, fire, night; and rest.

G. The only part which I recognize is a thunderstorm in the middle of the piece.

H. If I had not been told I do not think I should have felt any story; as it is the piece suggested successive batches of dolls out for a morning walk; they meet soon naughty boys, who rip them open and make the sawdust fly; wild war-dance of boys; one lone doll going home.

I. Lullaby; mother; baby; cradle; rocking; love-gentleness; good night. Changes to thunderstorm; fear; rain ceases; lullaby again. New theme thrust into the picture; leads up to a strong emotion; not quite tragic; hope of future for child. Now grows tragic, the sky of hope for the future clouded; trouble, sorrow; all may be a dream of the child's future by the mother; confused gathering to a climax; breaks; envoi.

If a *dream*, it (envoi) is a sad good night; but rather it is now the narrator saying "So it was, and so he died," "So it ended," "That was the end of him."

Played a second time. Lullaby as before, storm ditto, all as before.

J. Peace and quiet—sudden terror—violence, confusion. At the last a climax, as of a violent death, succeeded by silence, a hush. The main impression one of great *contrasts*, sudden changes in scene. Human strife breaking in upon human peace and happiness, or upon the quiet of nature; the whole rising to the climax; increasing rapidity and intensity of action; the catastrophe; the end.

K. A bare heath, or stretch of sand beach; she remonstrating with him, who is going. Then a battle, she seeking among the dead and wounded. Dido and Æneas.

The general form of which the preceding are the content would be: The sad calm of monotony broken in upon by a catastrophe whose succeeding waves overwhelm the soul.

L. The story which first suggested itself and which I can't get rid of, although it seems in places inconsistent, is of two persons at first amicable and then quarreling, finally becoming reconciled only to quarrel again. This seems (is) too trivial for such a magnificent thing. As to the musical enjoyment of this selection, it is very great. The more I think of it the more artificial my answer seems, though I have no substitute for it.

M. Extremely beautiful, especially at first. Early part suggested monastic life, as it should have been, in the middle ages. Then war sweeps over the country and demolishes the monastery. An effort is made to reconstruct the old life (whether it is a tale regarding an individual or a group I do not know), but the attempt is not finally successful. The life then becomes confused, mingles with the crude movements of cruel times, and ends in physical or moral battle. At the last moment occurs a recollection of earlier peace.

N. (My first sketch on first hearing thrown out on second hearing. The first was due to a false reminiscence.)

The hero of this bit of tragedy is in much the same world as Poe's lover in

"Thou wast that all to me, love
For which my soul did pine,
[A green isle in the sea, love
A fortress and a shrine,
All wreathed with fairy fruits and flowers
And all the flowers were mine.

Ah, dream too bright to last!

* * *

No more, no more, no more,
(Such language holds the solemn sea
To the sands upon the shore)
Shall bloom the thunder blasted tree,
Or the stricken eagle soar.

And all my days are trances
And all my nightly dreams
Are where thy dark eye glances
And where thy footstep gleams,
In what ethereal dances
By what eternal streams."]

(The poem is called "To One in Paradise.") Only he struggles more fiercely for the lost love, has a much more Titanic determination to win her back—but fails.

O. No *coherent* story suggested. At first it seemed as if a young girl were living a quiet passive life. Then an external misfortune, a war perhaps—not a gradual passion of her own—came upon her. The rest seemed a sort of pursuit and effort to rescue the victim. This involves the sacrifice of the old life, which at the time seemed dull and sad, but now seems beautiful.

On second hearing it seems there are three passions or tendencies, a solemn and awful one beside the exciting one. But I can't define what they are.

P. Summer: zephyr followed by storm.

Or hymn within a convent, and a surging crowd or a battle without.
In the soul: conflict with intervals of peace.

A raging soul listening to a distant church-service.

A. Fête champêtre. Children's minuet—in old fashioned dress.

A fierce storm; thunder, lightning; consternation, dispersion. End of dance, gravely.

After interval—a stately procession or polonaise, by the same company grown. A storm of warring passions. Reminiscence of first scene.

B. Disappointment, spirited endeavor, success.

C. The piece suggests to me the following dramatic situation: Firm, calm, resigned acceptance of fate or future by an earnest nature capable of deep feeling, though in opposition to desire; met by equally decided but stormy resistance and expostulation, on the part of an unprincipled and ardent nature, which is unsuccessful at the end, though unconvinced. Love would be presumably the theme.

D. A funeral march or dirge for a young girl chanted by her girl friends. A sudden contest and strife. I thought of Ophelia's death and Hamlet's struggle with Laertes. After long strife the dirge is repeated as if thought centred again about the dead girl.

E. A life capable, sensitive, forceful, recognizes very early its own possibilities for good and evil. The life is a fair one outwardly and the world judges it right in calling it blameless; but the world cannot see the inner mental and spiritual working.

(I.) The soul itself sees beneath its own outer and even inner calm; and recognizes that there is some element here that will work harm; it sadly feels its own powerlessness, or weakness of will to prevent the harm.

(II.) Then the thought of temptation with its horrible significance clashes on the soul; but the anguish caused by the thought repels it at

first, and keeps it at a hovering distance, yet the soul knows that the temptation will return. In this first period the soul knows that, mentally, it is stronger than its foe; but in the next stage, the soul is weakened and does not resist; it welcomes all the horror that it hated before and yields fully to the delight of the sin,—all this mentally.

So at the end, as in the beginning, it still appears calm and pure in the judgment of the world.

F. It is the story of a life beginning with a happy peaceful youth, suddenly broken in upon by excitement and adventure, ending finally in a return to the quiet, uneventful life of the early days.

G. First hearing. Scene, a square in a foreign town; cathedral spire; bells; procession of priests; organ music; enter church; sudden inrush of soldiers and people; gaiety, dancing; hush! reappearance of priests bearing a bier; bells and organ again. They pass on and new scenes, of varying character, occur; but all en masse and all in the same square. No *direct personal* drama of individuals.

Second hearing. A something ominous! War! Storm! a gathering in frightened groups. Ah! the bells again. . . .

H. I hear two antagonistic elements in conflict—the bells of cloisters inviting to tranquillity, and without, the raging storm and strife of men for earthly gain, where the strong conquers and the weak succumbs.

I. The opening movement naturally suggests a gondola, and that of course Venice with its thousand associations of intense and varied life and adventure; but it was Venice that suggested whatever images arose in my mind and not the music especially. Naturally Browning's "In a Gondola" was thought of; also a storm,—with wreck,—and returning calm, but the sullen calm of subsiding storm.

J. Peace and war; peace finally. The first part a mother soothing her child.

K. No story is suggested; but expostulation and sometimes entreaty opposed to a vehement and impulsive expression of something desired to be done at any cost.

L. Practising church music; old chants and quiet chorals not too grand, broken in upon by thunder-storms; boys' voices, and almost relief.

QUESTION V.

How would you describe the general mood which the following music is fitted to incite, or the atmosphere which seems to pervade it?

Beethoven. Pianoforte Sonata in E, op. 109. Andante Molto cantabile. The theme alone without the variations.

It suggests to me a mood of devotional meditation (Andacht).

Piano solo.

ANSWERS TO V.

A. I am still too much under the influence of number IV. to be affected by this number.

B. Doubt; hesitation.

C. Resignation.

D. Peaceful; but sadness in it.

E. Pensive; not passionate—and grave; not regretful. (Nothing more determinate!)

F. Prayer.

G. Proceeds from a placid mood in the presence of the sublime.

H. Religious.

- I. Devotional scene; not *very* religious, but dignified.
- J. Seriousness, solemnity, thoughtfulness, religious feeling.
- K. Reverent, joyful worship.
- Strasburg Cathedral; a procession passing along the nave; a choir-boy swinging a censer turns his face and looks at the spectator.
- L. Somewhat religious, though it has a shade of vague unrest in it.
- M. Religious; suggests some German church music.
- N. No impression worth noting beyond a general atmosphere as of a calm introduction to a dignified ceremony (?)—This interpretation seems doubtful.
- O. Not sure:—thought still about the former piece. Is it religious peace and resignation?
- P. Tender seriousness.
- A. Religious expansion; grateful worship of a full free heart.
- B. Seriousness of life.
- C. Tender religious melancholy tinged with a sense of pathetic pleasure.
- D. Placid retrospect.
- E. Known. A mood of comfort and endurance born from sorrow.
- F. Retrospection.
- G. Devotional; religious.
- H. Longing after a higher life.
- I. Hoch, heilig und hehr.
- J. A generous and complete nature.
- K. Self control and the quiet happy feeling that follows success.
- L. A restless person waiting for some tardy arrival, trying to forget himself in writing out some serious music.

QUESTION VI.

Do you detect anything not commonly depicted in music that finds its expression in this melody?

Mozart. Nozze di Figaro, Cavatina of Barberina "L'ho perduta" in the 4th act. According to Gustav Engel (*Aesthetik der Tonkunst* Berlin 1884, p. 134) Mozart has introduced *comic* traits into this air.
Violin and Piano.

ANSWERS TO VI.

- A. A fading and wilting flower.
- B. The wind crying through a knot hole in the attic, as I have heard it in an old tumble down house.
- C. A very sad humor. The impression of oddity and pathos is distinct to my mind.
- D. Indefinite.
- E. Sort of rustic uncouth unwillingness ending with consent.
- H. Seems to ask a question.
- I. She is told or discovers that he is not true; someone intercedes and says it may not be so. She with dignity but with firmness tinctured with deep grief resents the conduct and is turned against him. (Is not very definite in its suggestion; not clear.)
- J. Anxiety; weakness; as of a crying child; relief, as though the mother came.
- K. Not uncommon in music. Disappointment; "Well, never mind."
"Men must work and women must weep."
The pathos of monotony half felt in the midst of the commonplace.
- M. Plaintively beautiful. Yearning aspiration? Cannot think of any unusual feeling expressed.

N. The only impression would seem to me no more uncommon than any other. It is an impression of someone seeking in hope and sadness mingled for some lost thing—whether a lost child or a lost latch-key, I can't say. The search grows more painfully despairing and ends in giving the whole thing up. Even so I have looked in vain through all my pockets for the last nickel and found it not. The search is one made in grief, but there is no high tragedy.

(Certainly not consciously recognized in any way, nor remembered.)

Parenthesis added after learning real nature of piece.

O. Nothing clear.

P. Nothing, except, perhaps, a moan; yet the like is common in Mozart, e. g., in his Tito.

A. A sunny Mark Tapley-ism.

B. Anxiety; gentleness.

C. Indecision.

D. Questioning.

E. An every day customariness.

G. Seeking, doubt, questioning, despair.

H. A conversation of lovers in questions. Teasing.

I. Entirely engrossed by the music; no images or impressions.

J. Blindness.

K. The sweet, stern character of a noble woman.

L. A little child talking to her favorite doll, telling her how much she is loved and begging for an equal return of the love; then singing her off to sleep.

QUESTION VII.

Händel's air, "He was despised and rejected of men," from the Messiah, is generally regarded as a musical expression of great sadness, if not dejection. As the successive phrases of its introduction are now played through, indicate which contribute chiefly to its character of melancholy, and why they do so.

The notes of this selection were exhibited on a placard in sight of the listeners, the successive phrases being lettered as follows :



Of this fragment Gurney writes as follows (*Power of Sound*, p. 273) :
 "In the opening to 'He was Despised,' the pathetic effect in the sixth

bar of the G flat or minor third of E flat, as distinguished from the major G natural, which might have been used, is instantly recognized." Again (p. 329.): "The effect of the minor intervals in this melody was noticed in the chapter on Harmony; but the character is really set in the opening six [five] bars of the piece, before any such interval has occurred. Here the motion, grave throughout, owes its character of absolute dejection mainly to the two groups of three descending thirds in the middle; these receive a special intensity from the accents falling on the second of the three chords; and the pause after the first group emphasizes the effect of the reiteration, as though the power of movement were gathered again only to sink to a still lower depth of depression. . . . These features present a clear affinity to physical movements of drooping and collapse." Violin and piano.

ANSWERS TO VII.

A. It seems plaintive and supplicating to me, but not necessarily very sad; phrases *h* and *i* are perhaps sad.

B. The piece gives a *general* impression of *sadness*, rather than dejection; of mourning that the past is past, rather than of fear for the future or regret for the present.

C. The extreme dejection begins with the G flat, continuing through the next bar.

D. Phrases *e*, *f* and *h* contain the element of sadness; *i* is full of feeling; *i* and *a* and *g*, have the human feeling; the spiritual element comes in the *d* and *c*.

E. Phrases *c*, *f*, *h* (especially), pain! phrase *i* gives way.

F. All through, great dejection, especially *b c*, *e f*, and some notes in *h*; but (query) was it not the wail of the strings? Would it have been so on the piano alone?

G. Sad throughout, but especially in *a*, *d* and *g*.

H. To me the dejection is continuous.

I. The dejection comes first at *b*, next at *e*, but a trifle less here than at *b*. The climax is on *h*. Phrase *i* disappoints me as not fulfilling what was required to complete the dejection. The G flat in *h* is the decisive note.

J. The two falling cadences like sighs, and the last bar *giving way* to sadness.

K. The dejection comes in the first place from the abruptness produced by the short rests. The incompleteness of the short phrases *b c*, *e f*, suggests the cutting short of the life, whose grandeur is felt in the beautiful harmony in *a*, *d*, *g*, and *i*. These last form a connected whole of which the previous are an interruption.

In the second place the change of key in *e* and *h* adds to the sense of normal development interrupted; and this is further carried out by the minor in *h*.

The self-restraint produced by the pause between the second and third notes of the violin [which was played as above indicated, and as the phrase is sung, and not as it occurs in the introduction] adds to the pathos.

Phrases *a*, *d* and *g* represent the great soul struggling on its course; phrases *b c*, *e f*, *h*, represent circumstance, fate, the cutting off of the soul's course.

L. Close of phrases *a* and *g*, to some extent *b* and *c*, *d* and *e*. Most of all to me phrase *h* and beginning of phrase *i*, which seems to express an utter hopelessness. Of course, as a whole, the air is very sad.

M. Phrases *d* and *g* are spoken words of sadness; the phrases played by the piano alone are sighs; the halting notes at the conclusion are the culmination. The introduction of successive flats evidently causes a part of the effect.

N. The "dejection," apart from the tempo, is not marked in the first phrase, appears, however, in *b*, and in the contrast between the high and low phrases. The concluding phrase is one of a certain sorrowful consolation. Nor is the dejection anywhere without its accompanying and contrasted consolation, which appears in the phrases low in the scale as a certain gently solemn offset to the grief. In this contrast lies the chief art.

O. Decidedly at *h*. The rest is also sad, but *h* especially so; it is piercing. Dejection is not so much expressed in *h* as sadness.

A. Phrases *a* and *c*, deep sadness; *d* and *b*, tender compassion; phrase *h* is heroic; phrase *i*, exquisite pity (love).

B. The most touching, the three last measures.

C. Impression of dejection begins in *a*, increased in *d*, still more in *f*, complete in *i*; lost more or less, or perhaps I should say diminished, in the intermediate phrases.

D. The passage *d* expresses dejection, discouragement, most powerfully.

E. The whole selection contains profound dejection; the theme is announced in *a*; *b* and *c* are the sorrowful suggestions of the sufferer that there may be better things in store, yet even here the downward phrasing implies that hopelessness brings the hope immediately downward; *d* marks the better conclusion of the sufferer; *e* and *f* are new suggestions of hopeless hope, and *g* the heartbroken answer that the bitter fact remains; *h* is the admission of the counter-soul that pain is, after all, necessary; the final conclusion is one of the deepest depression.

F. Phrases *b* and *c*, and *e* and *f*, seem to express sadness, yet their expression of it would seem incomplete if they did not lead up to the phrases *d* and *g*; but *h* and *i* would, to me, separately express the tone of the whole fragment.

G. The poignancy of the sadness increases with each phrase, and culminates in the last heavy dejection and gloom at the end—a gloom not of anger, but of sorrow accepted.

H. The expression of deep sorrow and abandonment is accentuated at *e*, and, to my feeling, culminates in *h*, but after all, is very likely a resultant effect.

I. The phrase *a* is not conclusive, but taken to *d*, the expression of dejection is complete, without the other phrases.

J. Phrase *h*, beginning with the fifth note.

K. Impression of sadness through the whole piece.

QUESTION VIII.

What single adjective best expresses to your mind the general impression of the following music?

J. S. Bach. Well-tempered Clavichord: Prelude in E flat minor. In the "Conversation in Music" (p. 5.), Rubinstein writes: . . . "the tragic in no opera sounds, or can sound, as it is heard in . . . , or in the prelude in E flat minor of Bach's "Wohl-temperirte Clavier." Piano solo.

ANSWERS TO VIII.

- A. Religious.
- B. Unsatisfactory.
- C. Tragically sad. Widow of a dead patriot.
- D. Fanciful; full of fancy. Picture: Twilight; a woman playing and dreaming.
- E. ? ? ? ? Non-significant.
- F. _____.

- H. Sad.
- I. Funereal.
- J. Instability.
- K. Not light enough for "*fantastic*"; too much matter for the merely negative "*disjointed*." Whimsical.
- L. Interesting, but to me not particularly beautiful or great. It seems incomplete, more like an introduction to something else.
- M. Disjointed.
- N. This kind of thing declines to be expressed except as, say, a seraph's song, a song of one excelling in knowledge.
- O. Funeral march?
- A. Satisfactory.
- B. Soothing.
- C. Heavily monotonous.
- E. Known. Massive: the massiveness of a cathedral, with the delicate tracery of the frescoing and pillar ornamentation occasionally revealed by the light.
- F. Gloomy.
- G. Interesting and dignified; non-emotional.
- H. Serious (philosophical), majestically elevated—but to a dizzy height à la Beethoven.
- J. Languor; reluctance.
- K. Contentment.
- L. Feelings after a disappointment; not cheerless, but serious, and more uplifting than sad; at the same time more or less sad.

QUESTION IX.

Can you connect the following melody with any marked type of personal character?

Mozart: Don Giovanni: Canzonetta in the second act, sung by Don Giovanni to a mandolin accompaniment, "*Deh vieni alla finestra*." It was assumed that there would be some, at least, in the audience who would not recognize the song. It seems to me to bring out the two fundamental characteristics of a Don Juan: his powers of passion and the mocking indifference that lies beneath. Gurney speaks (p. 469) of "the half gay, half tender gallantry of the Guitar Song in Don Giovanni." Attention was specially called to the contrast between the melody and the accompaniment. Violin and piano.

ANSWERS TO IX.

- A. Known. Don Giovanni.
- B. A conflict of emotions; on the whole the higher purpose triumphs over the baser.
- C. Known; but it agrees with his character.
- D. The violin melody, a child telling a story, or a story told to a child; the accompaniment suggests the lightness of the whole. It doesn't matter, after all.
- E. D. J. and Laporello, nicht wahr? No other association, though I don't recall the last part.
- F. Rollicking roué, the accompaniment; more depth of character in air.
- H. Somewhat like the celebrated Don Juan Serenade; a passionate plea shut in in a laughing accompaniment.
- I. Mountaineer; hunter. This was written before I noticed the air. Don Giovanni Serenade.
- J. An earnest character with an underlying current of light-heartedness. One who thoroughly realizes the serious side of life, but who is

by nature an optimist and cannot entirely repress a natural joyousness.

K. David Rizzio. A combination of a Watteau shepherdess and Priscilla Mullins. Marie Bashkirtseff.

L. A person of merry temperament, but at the same time of serious intent. The running accompaniment gives this merry irresponsible character to it. The air on the violin is more serious, though at times quite merry itself, and also occasionally sentimental.

M. A fashionable or frivolous character with a deep undercurrent of sincerity. This idea did not come until attention had been called to the difference between accompaniment and violin melody.

N. Beyond the impression of the tempo, nothing expressible.

O. Isn't this Don Giovanni's Serenade? The feeling is in the air, the villainy in the accompaniment.

A. Levity; amorous sentiment.

C. Frivolity, and the earnestness really in the character.

E. Known. This does not suggest one particular type of character, unless, perhaps, it is the double character of frivolity with a steady strain of seriousness.

F. The contradictory character of a young woman.

G. A complex, fascinating woman, amid gay surroundings; or, a grave and thoughtful woman wearing a smiling exterior.

H. Known. Don Giovanni.

K. Known. Don Giovanni. Flippancy, or better, playfulness, feigned, concealing a sad heart.

L. Known. Don Giovanni.

QUESTION X.

Of what race should you think this song a product, and why?

"Der Rothe Sarafan." Russian popular melody. It has to my ear the monotonous sadness of the plains whence it has come. There is a terrible hopelessness in it; it seems an echo of immemorial misery borne with resignation.

Violin and piano.

ANSWERS TO X.

A. English.

B. The softness and the rather languid air about it betoken a southern nation, and I should say Persian.

C. Known; but I don't see why.

D. English.

E. Rothe Sarafan. Russian, I believe.

F. Irish; but too pathetic.

G. French.

H. German moonshine.

I. Old English; then recalled as Russian.

J. German. The music of a musical people, but of the peasantry because *simple*.

K. Central Germany.

L. Teutonic(?). Have no reason. Perhaps Slavonic(?).

M. English(?) or German.

N. Don't know it. Take it to be South German, but feel much doubt. Can feel no assurance.

O. Italian?

A. German — simplicity.

B. Not Italian, nor German, nor French.

C. A northern song, perhaps Norwegian or Russian, on account of its pathetic wildness.

E. German, because of its simplicity of feeling. Not light enough for France, nor sparkling enough for Italy, too much sentiment for England.

F. German.

G. Possibly Irish.

H. Known. Russian popular song. The melancholy is characteristic.

J. German. Sung by a homesick woman far away from her native land, possibly in America.

K. Unknown. Russian, because of its undercurrent of sadness.

QUESTION XI.

Is the singer of the following melody a man or a woman, and out of what emotional experience would such a song be born ?

Bizet. The song of *Carmen* in the third act of the opera, over the cards that foretell her death: "In van per evitar." The dramatic situation for which this song was written seems to me to be expressed in the music alone; a woman sings thus to tell herself that though life is sweet she must shortly die.

ANSWERS TO XI.

A. A woman has lost her husband in battle and is trying to console herself while singing to her young babe. Mingled despair and love for her child.

C. Woman; disappointed love.

D. Might be sung by either, possibly woman. Suggestion, the spirit of Schumann's "Ich grolle nicht."

E. First hearing. Either a man pathetically and simply pleading to a woman to have him, or a woman kindly and sweetly saying she must refuse. Second hearing. Decidedly a woman, and decidedly pleading, with a longing yet submissive spirit.

F. Woman; a farewell.

G. A man pleading with a woman who does not reciprocate his affection.

H. Maternal love.

I. Woman; jealous love.

J. Woman; intense protestation, sad, not angry.

K. Male.

L. Woman. Expression of some deep passion.

M. A girl mourning for her dead lover.

N. A woman resigns her dearest—a mother her son, a girl her lover,—for a noble end, a cause that demands him; she does not resign him to a blind fate, but to a cause. (Not at all recognized.)

O. A woman's sorrow and prayer. It is a sort of sublime calm despair.

A. A woman. A very loving plea for reconciliation, explaining her loyalty and faith in suffering.

B. Man; disappointment and despair.

C. Man; yearning wistfulness.

E. A woman who has suffered sings because conquered pain impels her.

F. Man; sorrow.

G. A woman; bewailing past joys.

- H.* Is it written for a man's voice? perhaps approaching death.
J. Man; passionate entreaty without avail.
K. A passionate woman; unrequited affection.
L. Woman; bewails loss of her lover; first wretched, then despairing, finally experiencing a gentler feeling and determined to make the best of it.

The evening began with a performance of the Andante from Mendelssohn's well-known and loved Concerto for violin and piano (Op. 64), on which three of the auditors took the following notes :

C. First movements of an undeclared love; middle of same; some disturbing circumstances in same, followed by repose.

K. Yearning; longing to go; attainment seen but recognized as impossible. Passionate pleading—struggle to transcend limitations.

The motive to the passion felt here are mixed. Partly they are the inevitable conditions of human life; partly the motive is love.

A. Education ethical; plea for purity and generosity; Strom der Welt; ethical practice on broad lines; justification; peace; beauty.

In ending the transcription of these notes of the first experimental attempt that as far as I know has ever been made to reach exacter notions in regard to the expressiveness of music, I cannot forbear acknowledging again my good fortune in obtaining aid of such temper and quality in the undertaking. Not only my thanks but those of all who are interested in the more careful study of the mental phenomena concerned in music hearing are due to this company of listeners for the zeal and the frankness displayed in these acute replies to an exacting series of questions.

Before proceeding to the examination of these suggestions from various music, let us endeavor to form some idea of the general nature of the inquiry in the pursuit of which they have been obtained.

To be continued.